



Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Association
P.O. Box 703, Madison, WI 53701
www.tenneylapham.org

TENNEY - LAPHAM

18 April 2022

Plan Commission
City of Madison

Dear Commissioners,

Our neighborhood steering committee met twice to review and discuss the proposed development for 609 E Dayton St. At the alder's neighborhood meeting and at the first steering committee meeting, discussions focused on the proposed design, preservation of the Reynolds Warehouse, concern about traffic, noise, and whether a hotel is an appropriate use in a residential neighborhood.

At the second steering committee meeting, more research into preserving the warehouse façade was presented as well as a new proposed façade for the hotel. At our third meeting, we finalized this report.

The report was reviewed and accepted at the 14 April Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Association monthly meeting.

Hotel in Residential Neighborhood

Many (not a majority of) steering committee members were concerned about the proposed Conditional Use of a hotel in a residential neighborhood. Some members mentioned that they would prefer to see an affordable housing development.

With the exception of the small warehouse at 609 E Dayton St, the neighborhood is solidly residential on this block and to the east, north, and west. In the Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood, commercial and high-rise residential development have been focused on East Washington Avenue while promoting existing mixed use on East Johnson St. While some committee members had no issue with the proposed development on E Dayton St, others wondered whether it was even wise to build yet another hotel on the isthmus.

Standards of Approval

3. The uses, values and enjoyment of other property in the neighborhood for purposes already established will not be substantially impaired or diminished in any foreseeable manner.

The Steering Committee requests that the Plan Commission review carefully the application for a conditional use of a hotel in a residential neighborhood. Most steering committee members accept that this is a permitted use in commercial zoning. A few committee members promoted the proposal. However, this lot is surrounded by family homes. Thus, many committee members questioned the appropriateness of this siting of a hotel.

6. Measures, which may include transportation demand management (TDM) and participation in a transportation management association have been or will be taken to provide adequate ingress and egress, including all off-site improvements, so designed as to minimize traffic congestion and to ensure public safety and adequate traffic flow, both on-site and on the public streets.

The steering committee agree that the proposed hotel entrance and garage entrance should be on E Dayton St. This will minimize impact on the East Mifflin Bike Boulevard. *However, the committee requests that a Traffic Demand Management Plan take into consideration the impact of significantly increased motorized vehicular activity on this block in a residential neighborhood.*

10. When applying the above standards to an application for a reduction in off-street parking requirements, the Plan Commission shall consider and give decisive weight to all relevant facts, including but not limited to, the availability and accessibility of alternative parking; impact on adjacent residential neighborhoods; existing or potential shared parking arrangements; number of residential parking permits issued for the area; proximity to transit routes and/or bicycle paths and provision of bicycle racks; the proportion of the total parking required that is represented by the requested reduction; the proportion of the total parking required that is decreased by Sec. 28.141. The characteristics of the use, including hours of operation and peak parking demand times design and maintenance of off-street parking that will be provided; and whether the proposed use is now or a small addition to an existing use.

The Steering Committee is concerned that the 2:1 room to parking space ratio is insufficient for the proposed hotel guests. *We request that the Plan Commission and Staff work with the developer to design a parking garage or other parking solution that can accommodate the proposed hotel's requirements.*

Design

The original design for the proposed hotel generated much negative feedback. Concerns ranged from the design's not matching the neighborhood to its being too large and out of scale. Committee members asked for a design that reflected the architectural diversity and history of the neighborhood and provided more visual interest. At our second meeting, the proposed façade was radically changed and better received. Overall, committee members found the current design a large improvement. The fenestration and vertical elements seem inspired by the existing warehouse façade.

If the request for demolition is approved, committee members ask the Plan Commission to require the developer to incorporate the medallions and the capitals or suitable replicas in the existing warehouse façade into the proposed hotel design.

The committee was pleased that the building design uses split-duct systems that should be quieter than wall-packs and that the ventilation exhaust for the underground parking will be

located in the back of the building. *Committee members ask the Plan Commission to require a quiet exhaust system in order to respect the surrounding residential neighborhood.*

Traffic Plan

Neighbors and committee members are concerned about the increased traffic and noise that the proposed development will bring. The committee agrees with the developer that proposed entrance should be on E Dayton St and not on the East Mifflin Bike Boulevard. However, the 600 block E Dayton is an atypically quiet street, and the proposed development will bring increased motorized vehicular traffic associated with hotel guests, food deliveries, ride shares, and café patronage.

Most steering committee members were also concerned about the potential impact of street parking in the area. While public transit is easily accessed at the proposed site, members were concerned that hotel guests will chose to drive a car and that the proposed small number of off-street parking spaces would be insufficient. Some members commented that the proposed BCycle kiosk and ZipCar(s) will help encourage fewer cars and that what we build for car storage in 2022 may not reflect the needs in 2032.

The committee did not review a Transportation Demand Management Plan for the proposed development. *Members request that the Plan Commission and Staff work with the developer to minimize traffic impact on the surrounding residential neighborhood.*

Façade Preservation/Demolition

Most committee members are frustrated by the developer's request to demolish the warehouse on E Dayton St. Some perceived that the currently empty warehouse provides no benefit to the neighborhood. Nevertheless, the character and the history of the existing warehouse contribute to the architectural and cultural resources of the neighborhood. Furthermore, The Landmarks Commission provided a b-c review of the warehouse building and we ask the Commissioners to read the staff report for this demolition request.

The majority of the steering committee is in favor of the preservation of the warehouse or at least its façade and asks the Plan Commission to deny the request for demolition. If the request for demolition is approved, the committee requests the Commission require the preservation of the warehouse façade.

Connection to Reynolds House

The steering committee is pleased with the developer's preservation of the Reynolds House. However, the connection of the proposed hotel with the rear of the house compromises the integrity of the original historic structure. Also, some of the open space between the buildings is lost. *The steering committee requests that the Plan Commission require that the Reynolds House remain a stand-alone building.*

Building Management Plan

We hope that the hotel guests will be quiet. Some members of the steering committee were concerned about the operation of a café potentially serving alcohol in the residential neighborhood. *If the application for the CUP is approved, the steering committee requests that the Plan Commission and Staff work with the developer to define an appropriate building management plan compatible with the general welfare of the neighborhood.*

More information

Plan Commissioners can review minutes of the steering committee meetings here:

<https://tenneylapham.org/about-tlna/development/dayton-hotel/>

Respectfully submitted,

Tyler Lark, President, Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Association